

Design of Digital Circuits

Guidelines on Paper Reviews

Prof. Onur Mutlu

ETH Zürich

Spring 2019

07 March 2019

How to Do the Paper/Talk Reviews

- 1: **Summary**
 - What is the problem the paper is trying to solve?
 - What are the key ideas of the paper? Key insights?
 - What are the key mechanisms? What is the implementation?
 - What are the key results? Key conclusions?
- 2: **Strengths** (most important ones)
 - Does the paper solve the problem well? Is it well written? ...
- 3: **Weaknesses** (most important ones)
 - This is where you should **think critically**. Every paper/idea has a weakness. This does not mean the paper is necessarily bad. It means there is room for improvement and future research can accomplish this.
- 4: Can you do (much) better? Present your **thoughts/ideas**.
- 5: **Takeaways**: What you learned/enjoyed/disliked? Why?
- 6: Any **other comments** you would like to make.

- Review should be short and concise (~one page)

Advice on Paper/Talk Reviews

- When doing the reviews, be very critical
- Always think about better ways of solving the problem or related problems
 - Question the problem as well
- This is how things progress in science and engineering (or anywhere), and how you can make big leaps
 - By critical analysis
- Sample reviews provided online